CLINICAL ETHICS CONSULTATION
FIRST INTERNATIONAL ASSESSMENT SUMMIT
April 4-6, 2003

Cleveland Renaissance Hotel
24 Public Square
Cleveland, OH 44113
Phone: 216-696-5600

Sponsored by
Department of Bioethics
Cleveland Clinic Foundation
*F. J. O’Neill Chair in Clinical Bioethics
Cleveland Clinic Foundation
*
Institute for Applied Ethics and Medical Ethics
University of Basel

Collaborating Organizations
American Society for Bioethics and Humanities
Australasian Bioethics Society
Bioethics Education Network of Ohio
Canadian Bioethics Society
European Society for Philosophy of Medicine and Healthcare
European Association of Centres of Medical Ethics
International Association of Bioethics Education Network
Swiss Academy of Medical Sciences

Scientific Committee
Co-Chairs
George J. Agich, Ph.D., Cleveland Clinic Foundation, USA
Stella Reiter-Theil, Ph.D., University of Basel, Switzerland

Members
Mark P. Aulisio, Ph.D., Case Western Reserve University, USA
Jeffrey T. Berger, M.D., FACP, SUNY Stoney Brook, USA
Nikola Biller-Andorno, M.D., Ph.D., University of Göttingen, Germany
Katrina A. Bramstedt, Ph.D., Cleveland Clinic Foundation, USA
Ronald Cranford, M.D., University of Minnesota, USA
Dan Dugan, Ph.D., Park Ridge Center, USA
Stuart G. Finder, Ph.D., Vanderbilt University, USA
Paul J. Ford, Ph.D., Cleveland Clinic Foundation, USA
Jacqueline Glover, Ph.D., University of West Virginia, USA
Christine Harrison, Ph.D., Hospital for Sick Children, Canada
Emilio Mordini, M.D., Bioethical Commission of the National Research Council, Italy
April 4, 2003
7:30 a.m.   Registration and Continental Breakfast

8:30 a.m.   Opening Session
George J. Agich, Ph.D., Cleveland Clinic Foundation
Stella Reiter-Theil, Ph.D., University of Basel

9:00 a.m.    Plenary Session
Development of Ethics Consultation in the United States
Ronald Cranford, M.D.
University of Minnesota

10:30 a.m.   Break

10:45-12:15 Concurrent Sessions

SESSION 1: DOCUMENTATION/COMMUNICATION
E-Consultation: Ethics Consultation Over the Internet, A Case Study
Robert Baker, Union College
Electronic Tracking of Consultation (ETC): An Innovative System for Improving Quality in Ethics Consultation
Kenneth A. Berkowitz, Barbara L. Chanko, and Ellen Fox, National Center for Ethics in Health Care
Elements of the Clinical Ethics Consultation Process: A Summary Document for Assisting the Development of Consultation Services
Bashir Jiwani and Rosemarie Muto, Provincial Health Ethics Network

SESSION 2: EVALUATION OF ETHICS CONSULTATION
Use of Simulated Ethics Consultation to Evaluate Ethics Consultation Teams (PANEL) [ends at 11:45]
Eugene C. Grochowski, Michael A. Williams, Cynda Hylton Rushton, Carlton Haywood, Tyler Reimschisel, and John H. Shatzer, Johns Hopkins University

SESSION 3: CASE ANALYSIS: DISABILITY, FUTILITY, AND LIVING DONATION
Do I have to be the new me I didn't choose? Experience with Ethics Consultation on quadriplegic spinal cord-injured patients?
Cynthiane J. Morgenweck, and Arthur R. Derse, Medical College of Wisconsin
“I shouldn’t have allowed you to write a DNR order for my wife!” A Case of Medical Futility?
Martin L. Smith, Anne L. Flamm, and Gregory H. Botz, The University of Texas
Organ Retrieval From a Mentally Retarded Man
David Steinberg, Lahey Clinic Medical Center
SESSION 4: EMPIRICAL RESEARCH
Nine Years and 500 Consults Later: A Data Summary of What We Did, and What We Learned
Anne L. Flamm, Martin L. Smith, and Garrett Walsh, The University of Texas M. D. Anderson Cancer Center
How do physicians deal with ethical difficulties on their own? A few things every ethics consultant should know
Samia Hurst, Sara Chandros Hull, and Marion Danis, National Institutes of Health; Gordon DuVal, University of Toronto Joint Centre for Bioethics
A Profile of the Ethics Consultant
Thomas May, Medical College of Wisconsin; J.M. Craig, Memorial Health System and Southern Illinois University School of Medicine

SESSION 2: MODELS AND FOUNDATIONS
Assessing Conflicts Among Consultants’, Clinicians’, Patients’, and Organizations’ Values in Ethics Consultation
Ana Iltis, Rice University
Rock or sand? Examining foundations of ethics consultation
Timothy Lillie, The University of Akron

12:15 p.m. Lunch

1:30 p.m. Plenary Session
Ethics Consultation and Ethical Case Deliberation: A European Perspective
Norbert L. Steinkamp, Ph.D.
University Medical Centre Nijmegen

3:00 p.m. Break

3:15-5:00 Concurrent Sessions

SESSION 6: EDUCATING CONSULTANTS
Training in the Theory and Practice of Clinical Ethics Consultation: Eight years' experience from an accredited graduate school course
Arthur R. Derse and Cynthiane J. Morgenweck, Medical College of Wisconsin
Integrating the “Clinical” into the Education of Bioethicists: The Role of the Clinical Ethics Fellowship
Paula Chidwick, William Osler Health Centre; Laurie Hardingham, Toronto Rehabilitation Institute/University of Toronto Joint Centre for Bioethics
The Role of Multidisciplinary Seminars in Cultivating Core Competencies in Ethics Consultation: Spirituality in Cancer Patient Care
Sumi Moon, The University of Texas M. D. Anderson Cancer Center

SESSION 7: DEVELOPING PROGRAMS IN EUROPE
Clinical Ethics Committees in Swiss Hospitals: An Overview
Michelle Salathé, Hermann Amstad, Margrit Leuthold and Michel Vallotton, Swiss Academy of Medical Sciences
Ethics consultation in the absence of ethics consultants: Can committees provide the service? Questions raised by recently established UK ethics committees
Anne Slowther, University of Oxford
Entering an Unknown Territory: Ethics Consultation at a German University Hospital as Ongoing Experiment
Thomas Wigant, Catholic Parish at the Heidelberg University Hospitals and Thorsten Schlenker, University of Heidelberg
SESSION 8: COMMON LAW MODEL AND COURTROOM INVOLVEMENT
Ethics Committees and the Courts
Ronald E. Cranford, Lisa Ellis, and Ann Russell, Hennepin County Medical Center
Clinical Consultation and the Common Law Model of Precedent
Katie Watson, Northwestern University Medical School

SESSION 9: ROLE AND POWER ISSUES
Recognizing the Political in Clinical Ethics
Christopher Meyers, California State University Bakersfield
Ethicists, ethicists and the goals of clinical ethics consultation
Frederick Adolf Paola and Robert Walker, University of South Florida College of Medicine

SESSION 10: AUTHORITY, EXPERTISE AND POWER
How Evidence-Based Medicine Might Benefit Ethics Consultation
A.M. Issa and J.M. Craig, Southern Illinois University School of Medicine
From All Sides: A Comparative & Prospective Ethnographic Study of Ethics Consultation
Andrea Frolic, Rice University

5:00 p.m. Adjournment

April 5, 2003
8:30 a.m. Concurrent Sessions
8:30-10:30

SESSION 11: IMPROVING QUALITY
Continuous Quality Enhancement of The Ethics Consultation Program
Laurence B. McCullough, Baylor College of Medicine
Project Evaluating Effectiveness in Clinical Ethics (PEECE)
Ross Upshur, Sue MacRae, and Clinical Ethics Group, University of Toronto Joint Centre for Bioethics
Appropriate Outcomes for Effective Ethics Consultation
David T. Ozar, Loyola University Chicago

SESSION 12: HOSPITAL ETHICS CONSULTATION EXPERIENCES
Evolution of Ethics Consultation at the Cleveland Clinic Foundation
George J. Agich, Ph.D., Cleveland Clinic Foundation
The integration of clinical ethics within the hospital practice: A French experience
Armelle de Bouvet, Catholic University of Lille
Ethics Consultation at the Hospital of the University of Pennsylvania: It’s primarily about communication
Mimi Mahon, and Horace M. DeLisser, Hospital of the University of Pennsylvania

SESSION 13: IMPACT OF LEGISLATIVELY ENDORSED CLINICAL ETHICS CONSULTATION
Experience With the Texas Advance Directives Act and the Resolution of Medical Futility (PANEL)
Robert L. Fine, Min Patel, and Chaplain Bob Duncan, Baylor Health Care System
SESSION 14: ISSUES OF STATUS AND STANDARDS
Going Pro: Professional Status and the Roles of the Bioethics Consultant (PANEL)
Kayhan Parsi (Moderator) and Mark Kuczewski, Loyola University Chicago
Deborah Cummins and Joal Hill, University of Illinois-Chicago

SESSION 15: METHODS AND MODELS
Criteria, and Advantages and Disadvantages for Three Methods of Ethics Consultation (PANEL)
Martin L. Smith, Annette K. Bisanz, and Ana J. Kempfer, The University of Texas
M.D. Anderson Cancer Center
Ethics Committee and Ethical Case Deliberation on the Ward: An Interactive Model
Norbert L. Steinkamp, University Medical Centre Nijmegen

10:30 a.m. Break

10:45 a.m. Plenary Session
The Question of Accountability
Bethany Spielman, Ph.D., J.D.
Southern Illinois University

12:15 p.m. Lunch

1:30-3:45p.m. Concurrent Sessions

SESSION 16: WHAT WE HAVE LEARNED: ESTABLISHED CONSULTATION PROGRAMS
Bioethics Consultation at Toronto's Hospital for Sick Children: Evolution through 'reflective equilibrium' (PANEL)
Christine Harrison, Alison Thompson, and Randi Zlotnik Shaul, The Hospital for Sick Children
Innovations in Clinical Ethics Case Consultation – Strengths, Weaknesses, and Future Directions (PANEL)
Lisa Anderson-Shaw, University of Illinois Medical Center; Susan MacRae, University of Toronto Joint Centre for Bioethics; Lainie Friedman Ross (presenter and moderator), University of Chicago

SESSION 17: PREREQUISITES FOR DOING ETHICS CONSULTATION
The Role of Clinical Expertise in Clinical Ethics Consultation (PANEL)
Denise M. Dudzinski, Clarence Braddock III, and Mark Tonelli, University of Washington
Justice or 'Just This'?
Jeffrey Spike, University of Rochester Medical Center; Joy D. Skeel, Medical College of Ohio

SESSION 18: CONSULTATION IN PEDIATRIC SETTINGS
Team-based ethical decision making process in the example of a neonatal and pediatric intensive care unit
Thomas M. Boesing, Christine Möhle, and Johannes Otte, The Gilead Hospital
To Feed or Not to Feed: Nutrition and Hydration in Pediatrics
Christine L. McHenry, Nancy Morwessel, William Scrivener, and Yvonne Stepter, Cincinnati Children’s Hospital Medical Center
Culture Clash and Intersex: Case Presentation
Sharon E. Sytsma, Northern Illinois University
Ethics Consultation at a Pediatric Medical Center: What We Have Learned About Process
Christine L. McHenry, Nancy Morwessel, William Scrivener, and Yvonne Stepter, Cincinnati Children’s Hospital Medical Center
SESSION 19: ETHICAL DECISION MAKING IN CHALLENGING SITUATIONS

Treatment Refusal and Decisional Competence Assessment
David Bekelman, and J. Carrese, Johns Hopkins University

Completing Suicide: Limiting Life-Sustaining Treatment in Cases of Self-Inflicted Injury or Overdose
Robert Walker and Frederick Adolf Paola, University of South Florida College of Medicine

Ethical decisions with mentally and psychically challenged patients: An experience report from a ward for internal medicine
Joerg Stockmann, Mara Hospital; R. Kolloch, The Gilead Hospital

SESSION 20: ORGANIZATIONAL ETHICS

Ethics Consultation as a Tool for Diagnosing Problems in Organizational Ethics: The Case of End of Life Care
F. Daniel Davis, Georgetown University

Why Clinical Ethics Committees should not address Organizational Ethics
Bob Hall, West Virginia State College

Administrative Ethics in a Community Hospital: Theoretical Insights and Practical Challenges
Daryl Pullman, Memorial University of St. John’s; Rick Singleton, Health Care Corporation of St. John’s

Duties, Conflicts and the Cultural Construction of the Deserving Patient: A Case Study of the Entanglement of Clinical and Organizational Ethics
Andrea Frolic, Rice University; Laurel Hyle, University of Houston

3:45 p.m.      Break

4:00 p.m.      Plenary Session
American Society for Bioethics and Humanities Ethics Consultation Task Force
What are the Educational Prerequisites for Ethics Consultation?
Mark Aulisio, Ph.D.
Case Western Reserve University
Jacqueline Glover, Ph.D.
West Virginia University

5:00 p.m.      Adjournment

April 6, 2003
8:15- 10:15  Concurrent Sessions

SESSION 21: CONSULTATION IN SPECIALIZED SETTINGS

Ethics Consultation in Cardiovascular Intensive Care Units
George J. Agich, Ph.D. and C. Allen Bashour, M.D., Cleveland Clinic Foundation

Ethics Problems and Ethics Consultation - The Research Experience
Gordon DuVal, University of Toronto Joint Centre for Bioethics; Marion Danis, National Institutes of Health

Making the Case for Ethics Consultations: Marginalization and Community Mental Health
Janet Hoy and Erika F. Feigenbaum, Case Western Reserve University

The Slowest Determines the Speed — Ethical Conflicts at a Hospice
H.-J. Flender, M. Kühnen, F. Mertzlufff; M. Klemm, M. Rauch, and D. Dommasch, The Gilead Hospital; A. Rieffel, U.Lübbert, Home of Assurance Hospice
SESSION 22: PROCESS CONSIDERATIONS IN ETHICS CONSULTATION
Appropriate Extent and Length of Involvement
Paul J. Ford, The Cleveland Clinic Foundation
Frank Virgil and His Three Daughters: Can Endotracheal Intubation Be a Comfort Measure?
Mark J. Bliton and Stuart G. Finder, Vanderbilt University Medical Center
Ethical Dilemma in a Patient with Brain Death after Cerebral Angioma Surgery
Klaus Kobert and Fritz Mertzlufft, The Gilead Hospital

SESSION 23: THEORETICAL APPROACHES TO ETHICS CONSULTATION
Reframing Clinical Ethics Consultations: A System’s Approach
Susannah L. Rose, Memorial Sloan-Kettering Cancer Center; Wayne Shelton, Albany Medical College
Ethics consultation process and family therapy techniques
John Z. Sadler, University of Texas Southwestern Medical Center
On the Role of the Clinical Ethicist
Mark P. Sheehan, Keele University

SESSION 24: CHALLENGES AND SOLUTIONS
What’s Wrong with Ethics Consultation? A National Survey
Gordon DuVal, University of Toronto Joint Centre for Bioethics; Marion Danis, National Institutes of Health
Putting the “Ethics” Back into Ethics Consultation: A Substantive, Cross-Cultural Critique of the “Mediation” Method as a Model of Clinical Ethics Consultation
Catherine Myser, Bioethics and Anthropology Consultation Service
Necessity and relevance of clinical ethics consultation
Gerald Neitzke, Hannover Medical School

10:15 a.m. Break
10:30 a.m. Plenary Session
Improving Quality in Ethics Consultation
John Fletcher, Ph.D.
University of Virginia

11:30 a.m. Closing Session

12:00 p.m. Adjournment